

University of Wollongong Research Online

University of Wollongong Thesis Collection
1954-2016

University of Wollongong Thesis Collections

2009

Fiscal policy and private saving in Australia: Ricardian equivalence, twin deficits and broader policy inferences

Shane Anthony Brittle
University of Wollongong, uow@brittle.edu.au

Follow this and additional works at: <https://ro.uow.edu.au/theses>

University of Wollongong

Copyright Warning

You may print or download ONE copy of this document for the purpose of your own research or study. The University does not authorise you to copy, communicate or otherwise make available electronically to any other person any copyright material contained on this site.

You are reminded of the following: This work is copyright. Apart from any use permitted under the Copyright Act 1968, no part of this work may be reproduced by any process, nor may any other exclusive right be exercised, without the permission of the author. Copyright owners are entitled to take legal action against persons who infringe their copyright. A reproduction of material that is protected by copyright may be a copyright infringement. A court may impose penalties and award damages in relation to offences and infringements relating to copyright material.

Higher penalties may apply, and higher damages may be awarded, for offences and infringements involving the conversion of material into digital or electronic form.

Unless otherwise indicated, the views expressed in this thesis are those of the author and do not necessarily represent the views of the University of Wollongong.

Recommended Citation

Brittle, Shane Anthony, Fiscal policy and private saving in Australia: Ricardian equivalence, twin deficits and broader policy inferences, Doctor of Philosophy thesis, School of Economics - Faculty of Commerce, University of Wollongong, 2009. <https://ro.uow.edu.au/theses/3032>

Research Online is the open access institutional repository for the University of Wollongong. For further information contact the UOW Library: research-pubs@uow.edu.au

NOTE

This online version of the thesis may have different page formatting and pagination from the paper copy held in the University of Wollongong Library.

UNIVERSITY OF WOLLONGONG

COPYRIGHT WARNING

You may print or download ONE copy of this document for the purpose of your own research or study. The University does not authorise you to copy, communicate or otherwise make available electronically to any other person any copyright material contained on this site. You are reminded of the following:

Copyright owners are entitled to take legal action against persons who infringe their copyright. A reproduction of material that is protected by copyright may be a copyright infringement. A court may impose penalties and award damages in relation to offences and infringements relating to copyright material. Higher penalties may apply, and higher damages may be awarded, for offences and infringements involving the conversion of material into digital or electronic form.

**FISCAL POLICY AND PRIVATE SAVING IN
AUSTRALIA: RICARDIAN EQUIVALENCE, TWIN
DEFICITS AND BROADER POLICY INFERENCES**

A thesis submitted in fulfilment of the requirements
for the award of the degree

Doctor of Philosophy

University of Wollongong
School of Economics
Faculty of Commerce
New South Wales, Australia

By

Shane Anthony Brittle

Bachelor of General Studies (Economics), University of South Australia
Master of Commerce (Quantitative Economics), University of Wollongong

October 2009

CERTIFICATION

I, Shane Anthony Brittle, declare that this thesis, submitted in fulfilment of the requirements for the award of Doctor of Philosophy, in the School of Economics, Faculty of Commerce, University of Wollongong, is wholly my own work unless otherwise referenced or acknowledged. The document has not been submitted for qualifications at any other academic institution.

Shane Anthony Brittle

October 2009

ABSTRACT

Concern in the United States over fiscal and current account deficits during the 1980s led to arguments that these deficits were linked, or “twins”. The Reagan Administration conducted an expansionary fiscal policy by cutting taxes, which was not accommodated by monetary policy. This placed upward pressure on US interest rates – which subsequently boosted the US dollar. The exchange rate appreciation led to a fall in net exports and a rise in the US current account deficit. Under these circumstances, the current account appeared to mirror the fiscal position, leading to the popularisation of the twin deficits hypothesis.

Similar concerns were also held in Australia. Following the depreciation of the Australian dollar after its float in December 1983, the remainder of the decade saw a widening of the current account deficit; while net foreign debt increased from around 6 per cent of GDP in June 1981 to 32 per cent five years later. This led to both political and community unease over the large current account and rising stock of net foreign debt. Policymakers subsequently focused on fiscal consolidation as a means of reducing the current account deficit – leading to the establishment of policies such as the trilogy commitments in the Commonwealth’s 1985-86 Budget.

An antonym to the twin deficit argument is provided by Ricardian equivalence, which asserts that deficits merely postpone taxes, and through the actions of altruistically motivated individuals, budget deficits have no real effects on the economy – including the current account. Australian academics during the late 1980s and early 1990s such as Makin (1988), Pitchford (1989) and Corden (1991) also challenged the notion that Australia’s level of net foreign debt and the current account were concerns for fiscal policy. They argued that private sector investment and saving decisions were made by optimising private individuals and organisations, with any benefits or costs of these decisions being a matter for these private agents.

Research interest in fiscal policy waned over the 1990s, and for the most part of the 2000s, as monetary policy assumed the role of stabilising short-term fluctuations in prices and output in most advanced economies. Fiscal policy was left to focus upon the medium-term sustainability of government balance sheets, which for Australia

was reflected in the introduction of the *Charter of Budget Honesty Act* by the Howard Government, and the adoption of its medium-term fiscal strategy.

More recently, the sharp economic downturn associated with the global financial and economic crises of 2008 and 2009 has seen fiscal stimulus packages enacted in many countries, and a renewed interest in activist fiscal policy. With little empirical knowledge on the efficacy of fiscal policy in modern economies, recent discretionary fiscal policies have been enacted without a thorough understanding of the potency of these policy actions – particularly given the marked structural changes in many developed economies over the past two decades (such as the increased integration of global product and financial markets).

The purpose of this thesis is to provide an assessment of the potential efficacy of fiscal policy in Australia as a countercyclical policy tool. More specifically, the thesis considers whether private saving behaves in a manner that is consistent with Ricardian equivalence, thus mitigating the effects of fiscal policy, or conversely, if fiscal policy has some ability to influence real economic activity – leading to effects consistent with the twin deficits hypothesis.

This thesis seeks to make an original contribution to the literature by first considering a large sample, both in the number of observations (188), and across almost 50 years from 1959-2006. Second, a great deal of attention is given to structural change in the Australian economy over this time – something which previous empirical literature (particularly for Australia) has paid little attention to. Econometric techniques that consider the possibility of two structural breaks in each time series will be utilised. Incorporating these structural breaks into a cointegration analysis will allow for the estimation of such a large sample. Further, the work conducted here provides a more up-to-date analysis of the efficacy of fiscal policy in Australia. As noted by Kennedy (et al: 2004), there is little empirical evidence on the efficacy of fiscal policy in Australia, or estimates of fiscal multipliers.

The analytical model employed in this thesis considers the extent to which private saving responds to changes in the total general government (Commonwealth, state and local) fiscal stance. While this framework lends itself towards explaining

Ricardian equivalence effects, it can also be considered as a broad measure of the impact of fiscal policy on short- and long-run aggregate demand. The model is estimated using the autoregressive distributed lag approach (ARDL) to cointegration, which provides both short- and long-run coefficient estimates, but also provides the flexibility to accommodate the introduction of coefficients for structural breaks.

As mentioned above, it is likely that the Australian economy has been subject to a substantial amount of structural change over the past 50 years. From the 1950s through to the early 1980s, the economy was heavily regulated, with markets subject to price controls and tariff protection, a fixed exchange rate, and government controls on bank deposits, interest rates and credit. The 1980s saw a period of rapid reform, with the floating of the dollar, removal of restrictions on credit creation, interest rates, foreign capital inflows and other broader reforms around market pricing and removal (or lowering) of tariffs and subsidies. Not accounting for these changes could lead to spurious results in the econometric analysis. While traditional Augmented Dickey-Fuller tests are conducted, the more advanced Lee and Strazicich one and two-break unit root tests are also used – which will also yield information regarding the timing of structural breaks in the Australian economy.

Results indicate that while there is not a full Ricardian response to changes in the fiscal stance, there is some partial offsetting behaviour. The results imply that fiscal policy does elicit some impact on the real economy which will be partly offset by increased private saving or other crowding out effects. Lower short-run private saving offsets revealed through the error correction mechanisms indicate that nominal and real frictions and/or rigidities prevent some proportion of any offsetting savings behaviour occurring more quickly. Additionally, some households may also be subject to short-run liquidity constraints. However, nominal and real rigidities appear to have lessened as the Australian economy has been subject to significant economic reform.

ACKNOWLEDGEMENTS

My greatest thanks are reserved for my PhD supervisors, Associate Professor Nelson Perera and Associate Professor Ed Wilson. You have both been patient with my progress in completing this thesis, and I am extremely thankful for the assistance and advice that you have provided to me. I hope that the experience has been one where I have also contributed new information and understanding into the Australian economy and macroeconomic policy. I look forward to working with you on other projects in the future.

I would like to thank the Commonwealth Treasury, which has provided both financial assistance for my PhD studies, and the flexibility to take leave in order to complete major parts of this thesis. I am grateful to my colleagues in the Macroeconomic Policy Division for providing useful insights into fiscal policy and the Australian economy, and with the opportunity to work on projects that have had direct relevance to this thesis. I would also like to thank Tony McDonald for prompting me to pay some attention to the economic concept and statistical measurement of saving.

I would also like to thank staff and participants in the International Monetary Fund's workshops on fiscal policy (Fiscal Policy: Fiscal Discipline, Institutional Considerations, and Public Investment) held in Washington D.C. over November 2007. These workshops enhanced my understanding of contemporary fiscal policy issues – greatly benefiting the preparation of this thesis. Advice provided by David Hauner (IMF Fiscal Affairs Department) on measuring financial openness was also extremely helpful.

TABLE OF CONTENTS

CERTIFICATION	i
ABSTRACT	ii
ACKNOWLEDGEMENTS	v
TABLE OF CONTENTS	vi
LIST OF FIGURES	ix
LIST OF TABLES	x
CHAPTER 1 INTRODUCTION	1
1. 1 Recent fiscal policy developments.....	1
1. 2 Research motivation.....	3
1. 3 Objectives of the study.....	4
1. 4 Contribution to the literature.....	5
1. 5 Organisation of the thesis.....	6
CHAPTER 2 LITERATURE REVIEW	8
2. 1 Introduction	8
2. 2 Empirical studies on the efficacy of fiscal policy	8
2. 3 Theories on the relationship between budget and trade deficits	13
2.3.1 The Ricardian equivalence theorem.....	13
2.3.2 The twin deficits hypothesis	19
2.3.3 Twin deficits in Australia.....	27
2.3.4 The intertemporal current account model	29
2. 4 Critique of the existing literature	30
2. 5 Summary and concluding remarks.....	31
CHAPTER 3 THE CURRENT ACCOUNT.....	34
3. 1 Introduction	34
3. 2 Balance of payments flows	34
3. 3 The Mundell-Fleming approach to the current account.....	36
3. 4 The intertemporal approach to the current account.....	40
3. 5 Summary and conclusions.....	46
CHAPTER 4 TWIN DEFICITS AND RICARDIAN EQUIVALENCE	48
4. 1 Introduction	48
4. 2 The twin deficits hypothesis	48
4.2.1 Twin deficits in the United States	49

4.2.2	Twin deficits in Australia.....	51
4.2.3	Twin deficit theory	55
4.2.4	The twin deficits and Keynesian macroeconomics	58
4.3	The Ricardian equivalence theorem.....	58
4.3.1	Ricardian equivalence in an open economy	63
4.3.2	Ricardian equivalence and alternative paradigms.....	64
4.4	Financial market liberalisation	65
4.5	Summary and conclusions.....	65
CHAPTER 5 ANALYTICAL FRAMEWORK.....		67
5.1	Introduction	67
5.2	Analytical model	67
5.3	The measurement of household and total private saving in Australia	70
5.4	Coefficient on public saving	74
5.5	Other coefficients	75
5.6	Data	81
5.7	Summary and conclusions.....	81
CHAPTER 6 STATIONARITY TESTING		83
6.1	Introduction	83
6.2	Stationarity tests	83
6.3	Single structural break tests	85
6.3.1	Zivot and Andrews test	87
6.3.2	Innovational outlier models	88
6.3.3	Additive outlier model	89
6.4	Multiple structural break tests.....	91
6.4.1	Two break tests	91
6.4.2	Other procedures	95
6.5	Estimation results	97
6.5.1	Augmented Dickey-Fuller test	98
6.5.2	Lee and Strazicich one-break test	99
6.5.3	Lee and Strazicich two-break test	101
6.6	Summary of the stationarity tests.....	103
6.7	Timing of the structural breaks	106
6.7.1	The 1960s resources boom.....	109
6.7.2	Expansion of social welfare programmes	109

6.7.3	The 1970s oil price shocks and inflation	109
6.7.4	Financial deregulation.....	110
6.7.5	The 1990-91 recession	111
6.7.6	Other break points	111
6.8	Summary and conclusions.....	112
CHAPTER 7 ESTIMATION AND HYPOTHESIS TESTING		114
7.1	Introduction	114
7.2	The autoregressive distributed lag approach (ARDL)	114
7.3	Structural breaks.....	118
7.4	Cointegration and error correction modelling.....	119
7.4.1	Private saving offsets – full sample (1959:3-2006:2)	120
7.4.2	Reverse causality.....	132
7.4.3	Private saving offsets – 1959:3 to 1983:4.....	134
7.4.4	Private saving offsets – 1984:1 to 2006:2.....	138
7.5	Summary of the estimations.....	142
7.6	Hypothesis testing	144
7.7	Summary and conclusions.....	147
CHAPTER 8 CONCLUSIONS AND POLICY RECOMMENDATIONS.....		151
8.1	Summary and conclusions of the study.....	151
8.1.1	Contribution to the literature.....	158
8.2	Policy implications.....	161
8.2.1	Discretionary fiscal policy	161
8.2.2	Fiscal sustainability	167
8.2.3	Other policy implications.....	167
8.3	Directions for further research	170
REFERENCES.....		172
APPENDIX A DATA DEFINITIONS AND SOURCES		198

LIST OF FIGURES

Figure 4.1 United States fiscal and current account balance (per cent of GDP).....	49
Figure 4.2 Australia's fiscal and current account balance (per cent of GDP).....	51
Figure 5.1 Net household saving ratio (per cent of GDP)	72
Figure 5.2 Net private saving ratio (per cent of GDP).....	73

LIST OF TABLES

Table 3.1 Current account of the balance of payments (\$A million).....	35
Table 3.2 Capital account of the balance of payments (\$A million)	36
Table 3.3 Balance of payments (\$A million)	36
Table 6.1 Results of the Augmented Dickey-Fuller test	98
Table 6.2 Critical values for the one-break LM unit root test (Model C).....	99
Table 6.3 Results of the one-break LM unit root test (Model A)	100
Table 6.4 Results of the one-break LM unit root test (Model C).....	100
Table 6.5 Critical values for the two-break LM unit root test (Model C).....	101
Table 6.6 Results of the two-break LM unit root test (Model A)	102
Table 6.7 Results of the two-break LM unit root test (Model C)	103
Table 6.8 Summary of the unit root test results	103
Table 6.9 Timing of the structural breaks	108
Table 7.1 Results from bounds test on equation (7.11) – 1959:3 to 2006:2	123
Table 7.2 Estimated long-run coefficients for equation (7.11)	124
Table 7.3 Error correction representation of equation (7.11).....	128
Table 7.4 Diagnostic tests on equation (7.11).....	129
Table 7.5 Estimated long-run coefficients for equation (7.12)	130
Table 7.6 Error correction representation of equation (7.12).....	131
Table 7.7 Diagnostic tests on equation (7.12).....	132
Table 7.8 Estimated long-run coefficients for equation (7.13)	133
Table 7.9 Results from bounds test on equation (7.11) – 1959:3 to 1983:4	135
Table 7.10 Estimated long-run coefficients for equation (7.14)	136
Table 7.11 Error correction representation of equation (7.14).....	137
Table 7.12 Diagnostic tests on equation (7.14).....	138
Table 7.13 Results from bounds test on equation (7.11) – 1984:1 to 2006:2	139
Table 7.14 Estimated long-run coefficients for equation (7.15)	140
Table 7.15 Error correction representation of equation (7.15).....	141
Table 7.16 Diagnostic tests on equation (7.15).....	141
Table 7.17 Confidence intervals – long-run coefficients for government saving....	146
Table 7.18 Confidence intervals – short-run coefficients for government saving...	147